

Traffic Stop Quarterly Report 13: Extended Traffic Stop Indicator Use MCSO Response

The Office has considered internal and external recommendations to address findings of disparity from the 13th Traffic Stop Quarterly Report (Q1 2024) on the use of Extended Stop Indicators (ETSI). While the study determined Deputies were using the extended stop indicators appropriately, several action items/recommendations were considered to further improve our data collection and understanding of traffic stop delays at MCSO. Additionally, the DOJ had requested an analysis that compared difference in the average length of stop between each racial/ethnic group for each ETSI used. The results of that analysis are presented under Recommendation 7 as TSQR 13 Addendum: Additional Analysis.

Recommendation 1: Review stops for which “Other” was selected but for which there is no clear description of the delay in the Vehicle Stop Contact Form (VSCF) and send out data validations as necessary.

Action Item 1: In order to ensure that deputies don’t miss this requirement, a new text box is being added to the VSCF that will be activated when the “Other” ETSI is checked. This box will have the explicit instruction “Describe what other issues delayed the stop:” Text will need to be entered before the deputy can move on to the next field in the form. This should reduce the already low number of stops where a deputy selects “Other” and the comment does not clearly represent what the delay was.

Status Update 1: This has been developed in IT and pending deployment, it is anticipated it will be deployed in Q4 of 2024.

Status Update 2: This has been completed but is awaiting approval of GJ-3 Search and Seizure Policy before it can be deployed. (Pending Approval)

Recommendation 2: Review stops and stop data for stops that have unusual stop lengths associated with ETSI use.

Action Item 1: This is an ongoing process. Stops with unusual lengths are reviewed monthly by MCSO’s Traffic Stop Analysis Unit (TSAU). In addition to reviewing for accuracy and sending out data validations as necessary, sergeants are taking note of “lessons learned” to provide at Internal Town Halls, district briefings, and for Training to incorporate into appropriate curriculum.

Status Update 1 (Q3 2024): TSAU continues to monitor these stops and send out data validations as necessary. In the months of review (July-September 2024),

- 1 data validation has been sent out.
- 0 referrals have been made to PSB or supervisors as no further issues have been identified.

Status Update 2: TSAU continues to monitor these stops and send out data validations as necessary. In the months of review (October-November 2024)

- 44 data validations were sent out.
- 0 referrals have been made to PSB or supervisors as no further issues have been identified.

Traffic Stop Quarterly Report 13: Extended Traffic Stop Indicator Use
MCSO Response

Recommendation 3: Review long non-extended stops (those that exceed 20 minutes) and send out data validations as necessary.

Action Item 1: This is an ongoing process. Stops without any ETSI that exceed 20 minutes are reviewed monthly by TSAU, including watching Body-Worn Camera (BWC) footage, to follow up as necessary to determine if an ETSI was present, but not documented. In addition to reviewing for accuracy and sending out data validations as necessary, sergeants are taking note of “lessons learned” to provide at Internal Town Halls, district briefings, and or for Training to incorporate into appropriate curriculum.

Status Update 1 (Q3 2024): TSAU continues to monitor these stops and send out data validations as necessary. In the months of review (July-September 2024),

- 1 data validation has been sent out.
- 0 referrals have been made to PSB or supervisors as no further issues have been identified.

Status Update 2: TSAU continues to monitor these stops and send out data validations as necessary. In the months of review (October-November 2024)

- 44 data validations were sent out.
- 0 referrals have been made to PSB or supervisors as no further issues have been identified.

Recommendation 4: Disseminate or publish guidelines or “cheat sheet” on the appropriate use of ETSIs. Include use of ETSIs in TSAR training, including the appropriate use of the “Other” category.

Action Item 1: TSAU will create a “cheat sheet” using language that aligns with what is noted in TraCS, the software system housing the traffic stop forms, and that which has been approved per policy and traffic stop methodologies.

Status Update 1: This was created and deployed at the June Captain’s meeting and was then briefed down the chain of command with HUB attestations. Additionally, this was discussed by the TSAU Sgts. during their internal town halls that occurred in each district and shift in Q3 of 2024. (Completed)

Action Item 2: ETSI “cheat sheets” will be introduced at Captain’s Meetings and provided at Town Halls, and liaisons will make copies available at each district in Quarters 2 and 3 of 2024.

Status Update 1: This was created and deployed at the June Captain’s meeting and was then briefed down the chain of command with HUB attestations. Additionally, this was touched on by the TSAU Sgts. during their internal town halls that occurred in each district and shift in Q3 of 2024. (Completed)

Action Item 3: Provide consistent messaging as to when ETSIs are to be used. There is some confusion about whether to use an ETSI when any of the situations occurred *and* the deputy

Traffic Stop Quarterly Report 13: Extended Traffic Stop Indicator Use MCSO Response

perceives it to have been the cause of the time delays to their stop, or anytime the situation occurred. As such, leadership shall establish a consistent message as to when ETSIs are to be used (each time a situation occurs vs. the deputy perceives the situation delayed them). This message shall be shared during Captain's meetings, Town Halls and training. Data Validations will align with the official message. This began with a Captains Meeting on June 24, 2024, and will continue throughout Quarter 3 2024.

Status Update 1: The "cheat sheet" and messaging was created and deployed at the June Captain's meeting and was then briefed down the chain of command with HUB attestations. Additionally, this was discussed by the TSAU Sgts. during their internal town halls that occurred in each district and shift in Q3 of 2024. (Completed)

Recommendation 5: Conduct Internal Town Halls with each district going over the results of this study to inform on each district's unique circumstances that delay traffic stops.

Action Item 1: Discussion of appropriate use of ETSIs and the introduction of "cheat sheets" were briefed at the Captain's Meeting on June 24, 2024.

Status Update 1: The "cheat sheet" and messaging was created and deployed at the June Captain's meeting and was then briefed down the chain of command with HUB attestations. Additionally, this was discussed by the TSAU Sgts. during their internal town halls that occurred in each district and shift in Q3 of 2024. Additionally, research findings from TSQR 13, TSQR 14 and TSAR 9 were presented and discussed in each district by CID researchers. (Completed)

Action Item 2: Findings will be shared, along with "cheat sheets", with district personnel through a series of Internal Town Halls in each district in the third quarter of 2024. Topics will include these findings, as well as Traffic Stop Annual Report 9 (TSAR 9) findings and the District Specific findings of the TSAR analysis (TSQR 14) which will be published June 30, 2024.

Status Update 1: The "cheat sheet" and messaging was created and deployed at the June Captain's meeting and was then briefed down the chain of command with HUB attestations. Additionally, this was discussed by the TSAU Sgts. during their internal town halls that occurred in each district and shift in Q3 of 2024. Additionally, research findings from TSQR 13, TSQR 14 and TSAR 9 were presented and discussed in each district by CID researchers. (Completed)

Recommendation 6: Communicate with Fleet Management to inspect vehicles and equipment associated with a high proportion of stops experiencing technical issues.

Action Item 1: Given the variety of units responsible for the maintenance of the different pieces of equipment that could be included under technical issues, TSAU will generate a list

Traffic Stop Quarterly Report 13: Extended Traffic Stop Indicator Use
MCSO Response

vehicles and deputies with at least 20 technical issues indicated over the course of a year and provide this list to the following groups for their review and information:

- i. Radio Shop
- ii. Equipment Services
- iii. IT – Mobile Dispatch Computers (MDC) Support
- iv. Admin Sergeants at Districts

Status Update 1: This list of Deputies and Vehicles were sent out to various departments in Q3 of 2024. (Completed)

Recommendation 7: During the approval process for the methodology of TSQR 13, the DOJ recommended the following analysis be completed, however it was not in the final approved methodology. MCSO has conducted the requested analysis and presents the findings in the TSQR 13 Addendum: Additional Analysis included with this Response.:

Status Update 1: This analysis was completed and is included as an Addendum to this Response. (Completed)

**Traffic Stop Quarterly Report 13: Extended Traffic Stop Indicator Use
MCSO Response**

TSQR 13 Addendum: Additional Analysis

In the tables below we provide stop lengths for White, Hispanic, Black, and Minority drivers (Asian, Black, Hispanic, and Native American combined) for stops with single ETSIs selected. We compare the difference between White stops with and without an ETSI and Hispanic, Black, and Minority stops with and without an ETSI. Difference-in-difference values are provided per the following formulas, as requested by Dr. Knox of the DOJ:

$(Avg\ time\ (Hispanic,\ ETSI) - Avg\ time\ (Hispanic,\ no\ ETSI)) - (Avg\ time\ (White,\ ETSI) - Avg\ time\ (no\ ETSI))$ $(Avg\ time\ (Black,\ ETSI) - Avg\ time\ (Black,\ no\ ETSI)) - (Avg\ time\ (White,\ ETSI) - Avg\ time\ (no\ ETSI))$ $(Avg\ time\ (Minority,\ ETSI) - Avg\ time\ (Minority,\ no\ ETSI)) - (Avg\ time\ (White,\ ETSI) - Avg\ time\ (no\ ETSI))$

To avoid the confounding effects of multiple extended stop indicators during a stop, only stops with a single ETSI selected and stops with no selected ESTI were used in calculating the difference-in-difference.

- The overall average stop length for White drivers with no documented delay during the stop was 11.14 minutes (N = 7,880).
- The overall average stop length for Hispanic drivers with no documented delay during the stop was 11.73 minutes (N = 2,226).
- The overall average stop length for Black drivers with no documented delay during the stop was 11.63 minutes (N = 747).
- The overall average stop length for Minority drivers with no documented delay during the stop was 11.68 minutes (N = 3,421).

<p>When looking at the tables below, the far-right column (X-Diff minus W-Diff) represents the difference in delay between the comparison group and white drivers caused by each individual ETSI. Noticeably, the differences are small in most cases and those negative difference values indicate that white drivers experienced a longer delay than the comparison minority group.</p>

Table 1: Difference-in-difference for stop length, ETSIs, Searches and Arrests; Hispanic compared to White

ETSI	N Hispanic stops with ETSI	Hispanic Stop Length With ETSI	Hispanic Difference	N White stops with ETSI	White Stop Length With ETSI	White Difference	H-Diff minus W-Diff
Any One ETSI	1,445	16.90	5.17	2,762	16.16	5.02	0.15
Arrest	90	14.47	2.74	216	14.39	3.25	-0.51
Driving Documentation	816	17.20	5.47	1,419	16.02	4.88	0.59
DUI	31	17.55	6.41	47	19.40	8.26	-1.85
Language	99	16.57	4.84	4	13.00	1.86	2.98
Search	2	16.00	4.27	1	28.00	16.86	-12.59
Technical	156	16.14	4.41	436	15.94	4.8	-0.39
Tow	3	51.00	39.27	0	N/A	N/A	N/A
Training	147	16.12	4.39	347	15.32	4.18	0.21

**Traffic Stop Quarterly Report 13: Extended Traffic Stop Indicator Use
MCSO Response**

Other Delay	101	18.11	6.38	291	18.97	7.83	-1.45
-------------	-----	-------	------	-----	-------	------	-------

Table 2: Difference-in-difference for stop length, ETSIs, Searches and Arrests; Black compared to White

ETSI	N Black stops with ETSI	Black Stop Length With ETSI	Black Difference	N White stops with ETSI	White Stop Length With ETSI	White Difference	B-Diff minus W-Diff
Any One ETSI	525	17.72	6.09	2,762	16.16	5.02	1.07
Arrest	29	14.24	2.61	216	14.39	3.25	-0.64
Driving Documentation	338	17.77	6.14	1,419	16.02	4.88	1.26
DUI	11	22.09	10.46	47	19.40	8.26	2.20
Language	6	13.17	1.54	4	13.00	1.86	-0.32
Search	0	N/A	N/A	1	28.00	16.86	N/A
Technical	48	15.67	4.04	436	15.94	4.80	-0.76
Tow	4	52.00	40.37	0	N/A	N/A	N/A
Training	39	16.23	4.60	347	15.32	4.18	0.42
Other Delay	48	16.69	5.06	291	18.97	7.83	-2.77

Table 3: Difference-in-difference for stop length, ETSIs, Searches and Arrests; Minority compared to White

ETSI	N Minority stops with ETSI	Minority Stop Length With ETSI	Minority Difference	N White stops with ETSI	White Stop Length With ETSI	White Difference	M-Diff minus W-Diff
Any One ETSI	2,185	16.99	5.31	2,762	16.16	5.02	0.29
Arrest	137	14.32	2.64	216	14.39	3.25	-0.61
Driving Documentation	1,256	17.24	5.56	1,419	16.02	4.88	0.68
DUI	45	19.38	7.7	47	19.40	8.26	-0.56
Language	115	16.69	5.01	4	13.00	1.86	3.15
Search	2	16.00	4.32	1	28.00	16.86	-12.54
Technical	234	15.99	4.31	436	15.94	4.80	-0.49
Tow	7	51.57	39.89	0	N/A	N/A	N/A
Training	218	15.61	3.93	347	15.32	4.18	-0.25
Other Delay	169	17.50	5.82	291	18.97	7.83	-2.01

Conclusion

MCSO has established an internal review group made up of staff and command members in a position to implement the actions proposed above. This group meets on a monthly basis, and each action item will include a status update and successes and challenges identified. Additionally, actions that have occurred will be discussed in the following studies for which these actions may have made an impact. MCSO recognizes that the traffic stop reports are cyclical in nature, with potential indicia of bias findings triggering the need for MCSO to monitor and intervene. The action items noted above are the interventions MCSO has identified for TSQR 13. MCSO notes it is important to recognize that each annual report is an entirely new set of data that may not align with intervention

Traffic Stop Quarterly Report 13: Extended Traffic Stop Indicator Use
MCSO Response

timeframes, and that findings from subsequent analyses have limitations as a measure for assessing the success for the previous interventions.